



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

land as well as New England. In his section of the country, to be sure, there was much fanaticism, but Arnold, a man undoubtedly influenced by religious intolerance, was not exactly the proper person to rebuke bigotry. When so grand a character as Washington did so in connection with a proposed celebration of Guy Fawkes' day, it was necessary that his objection be stated with great circumspection.

Our author should have known that George Washington was not born at Mount Vernon. A better knowledge of the characters of the Revolutionary era would have told him that Charles Carroll of Carrollton was a cousin, not a brother of Reverend John Carroll. Yet from one or two slips the reader of this very interesting story is not to conclude that Mr. Stimson knows little of the Revolution, for he knows the epoch not only in outline but in nearly all its important details. Every citizen having even a distant interest in the progress of the struggle for American independence should read this book, for in its attractive pages he will learn many useful facts not sufficiently emphasized by the historians. So long after that crowning act of infamy at West Point we can only regret that all Americans of that day did not see things as clearly as General Washington and that in consequence of their limitations a great soldier was driven from the ranks of the Revolutionary army.

The Quest of El Dorado. By the Rev. J. A. Zahm, C.S.C., Ph.D. (H. J. Mozans). New York and London: D. Appleton & Co., 1917. Pp. xvi+261. Maps and illustrations.

Frequent reference has been made in the pages of the *Catholic Historical Review* to the scholarly contribution to South American history, especially Catholic history, given to the world by Dr. Zahm, under the attractive form of travelogues. His work is all the more valuable because it is unique. Dr. Zahm is the only Catholic scholar writing in English who has made extensive use of the sources of South American history, and the phenomenal success met by his trilogy, *Following the Conquistadores*, contains an urgent invitation to Catholic scholars to follow him in this interesting and profitable study.

The present volume, which comes as a sort of appendix to the other three, drops the travelogue form, and consists of a

collection of the most authentic accounts of what is described in the sub-title as "the most romantic episode in the history of South American conquest." The book is made up almost entirely of a series of essays written in 1912 for the *Bulletin of the Pan-American Union*. Interest in the subject has widened since that time, and Dr. Zahm's publishers have felt justified in preserving these articles in book form. Historians must be grateful for this care, for they present the only complete and accurate account in English of the various expeditions that for almost a century explored northern South America in search of the elusive Gilded Man.

If it served no other purpose than to introduce us to its sources, Dr. Zahm's book would be invaluable. Juan de Castellanos, soldier, priest, poet and historian, is the first of the obscure literary geniuses to whom we are introduced. Castellanos, like Calderon de la Barca, abandoned his military career at an advanced age, to seek the spiritual solace of the ecclesiastical state, and the rare consolations of versification. He wrote history in easy, flowing, graphic verse, and his two books, *Elegias de Varones Ilustres de Indias* and *Historia del Nuevo Reino de Granada*, constitute the best account of the conquest of northern South America. And yet so little is his work known that the latter book, published first in 1889, is described in the *Catholic Encyclopedia* (s.v. Castellanos) as existing only in MS.

The chronicler Fresle, son of one of the conquistadores of New Granada, is another obscure writer of merit from whom Dr. Zahm borrows accounts of El Dorado. Don Lucas Piedrahita, the famous *mestizo* Bishop of Panama, and Padre Simon are two ecclesiastical historians of the highest merit. Father Zahm rescues from the obscurity of their rare works interesting details of the exploration of northern South America that anticipated modern travel by three and a half centuries. Padre Gumilla, Fray Laureano de la Cruz, Francisco Vasquez and Toribio de Ortiguera, blend their accounts with the better-known authorities, Herrera, Oviedo y Valdés, Garcilaso de la Vega, Zárate and López Gómara. Fray Gaspar de Carvajal—a character who should be set down with Juan de Castellanos for special biographical study by some enthusiastic lover of romance—gives us the account of the discovery and first exploration of the

Amazon River—an account written long after his supposed murder by the discoverer, Francisco de Orellana. Bibliographers would do well to note the existence of this book, *Descubrimiento del Rio de las Amazonas, según la Relación hasta ahora inédita de Fr. Gaspar Carvajal* (Sevilla, 1894), and avoid the egregious blunder of a recent writer whose short biography of the author repeats the story handed down by Zárata and others through Prescott, that Carvajal was left to die in the jungle, and although it describes his later life as Provincial of the Dominicans in Peru, makes no reference to his chronicle of Orellana's expedition.

The Quest of El Dorado is a bibliographical study only in a secondary way, but since it is unique in its field, its bibliographical material is of the highest importance for the historian. Dr. Zahm's main purpose is to tell the story of El Dorado. This he does by reviewing the accounts of twelve different expeditions.

The name El Dorado seems first to have been given by the Spaniards, in 1535, to an Indian chieftain, described to them by a roving Indian as the lord of a rich city and province, and priest of a cult that offered a sacrifice of gold to the Devil. Castellanos and Fresle describe the ritual of the sacrifice. On assuming office, they say, the chieftain, after being stripped, was anointed with a resinous substance that served as a base for powdered gold that was blown over him through hollow canes until he glistened with gold from head to foot. He then proceeded to the middle of a sacred lake (supposedly Guatavita, northeast of Bogotá) in a *balsa*, with a great quantity of gold and emeralds to be offered in sacrifice. After throwing these into the lake, to the accompaniment of sacred music, the Gilded Man returned to shore and was received by the people as their lawful chief.

With the spread of the account of this strange ceremony, and the increased interest aroused in the search for the country so rich in treasure, the story varied, and the name itself lost its restricted sense and came to be applied to the city and province over which the chieftain ruled. It is in this wider sense that the expression has come down to us as designating a place of vast riches.

Of course, the expeditions in search of El Dorado all had the same dismal result: drenched with rains that "baptized

their very souls," men starved in the wilderness or returned haggard and ill to spend their remaining days in broken health; fortunes many times greater than that spent in the discovery of America were swallowed up in the jungle; enmities arose out of keen competition to find the prize. But though there is a sameness in the narratives, each has its peculiar romance. The expedition of the German Von Hutten, for instance, claimed to have come within sight of the fabled city, which was so large that it stretched beyond their range of vision, and then, after defeating an army of 15,000 Indians with forty Europeans, turned back for more men to pursue the enterprise. This story was graphically told, and was so confidently believed that it formed the chief argument for some of the expeditions that followed.

The account of Sir Walter Raleigh's expedition (Chapter VIII), is a skilful and pleasant argument against the common belief that the Spaniards were the only credulous seekers after phantom gold in that day when so many dreams really came true. The account of Raleigh's expedition is taken from his own story, *The Discovery of the Large, Rich and Beautiful Empire of Guiana, with a Relation of the Great and Golden City of Manoa, which the Spaniards call El Dorado*, etc. (Hakluyt Society, 1848). The tales he tells and the impossible inhabitants with which he peoples the far-away land have been preserved in the maps of De Bry and others. Raleigh read and believed all the fanciful accounts of the Spanish chroniclers, and when he reached the delta of the Orinoco and captured Indians and Spaniards to obtain from them precise information regarding El Dorado, he believed the wildest tales they told him. He transcribes from Gómara's *Historia General de las Indias*, the following account of the Gilded Man:

"All the vessels of his home, table and kitchen, were of gold and siluer and the meanest of siluer and copper for strength and hardiness of the metal. He had in his wardroppe, hollow statues of golde which seemed giants, and the figures in proportion and bignes of all the beasts, birdes, trees and hearbes that the earth bringeth forth; and of all the fishes that the sea or the waters of his kingdom breedeth. Hee also had ropes, budgets, chests, and troughs of golde and siluer, heaps of billets of golde that seemed woode, marked out to brune. Finally

there was nothing in his country, whereof he had not the counter-feat in golde.”

For an estimate of the simple faith of this staid Briton, Dr. Zahm goes to his countryman, Sir Frederick Treves, who declares:

“There never was a more romantic river voyager; never a more rapturous wild-goose chase. Raleigh was infinitely gullible. He believed every word the romance-loving Spaniards told him as if he had been a gaping schoolboy. He trusted Juan Martines as a modern traveler trusts his Baedeker. He gathered inspiration and assurance from any dull-witted Indian who nodded ‘yes’ to the unintelligible questions of his interpreter.”

Dr. Zahm’s book, especially the chapter on Raleigh, will do noble service in readjusting historical values. Catholics must be thankful for the service, since so much is still done in our time to disparage the exploits of Catholic Spain in the discovery and exploration of America. Typographically, the book is worthy of the publishers. The numerous illustrations that enliven the narrative are from ancient woodcuts in De Bry, Colijn, Gottfriedt and Herrera. There is a good bibliography and full index.

The Virginia Committee System and the American Revolution.

By James Miller Leake, Ph.D., Associate in History in Bryn Mawr College. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1917. Pp. 152, Series xxxv, No. 1. Johns Hopkins University Studies in Historical and Political Science, under the Direction of the Departments of History, Political Economy, and Political Science.

A service of special importance has been rendered to students of early American history by Dr. Leake’s skillful presentation of the above difficult subject. Personal researches by the author in the Library of Congress and among the valuable archives of the Virginia State Library and of the Virginia Historical Society, give added weight to his conclusions.

A good insight into the purpose and character of the work is afforded by a study of the brief, but comprehensive, introduction. The author points out how, heretofore, the committees of the Virginia system have been studied mainly as isolated units